

How to cite this article in bibliographies / References

G Cordero Arroyo, NL Carrillo Chávez, M López-Ornelas, AG Zepeda Fuentes (2019):
“Editorial features of scholarly journals published by Mexican teacher-training colleges”.
Revista Latina de Comunicación Social, 74, pp. 325 to 346.
<http://www.revistalatinacs.org/074paper/1333/16en.html>
DOI: [10.4185/RLCS-2019-1333en](https://doi.org/10.4185/RLCS-2019-1333en)

Editorial features of scholarly journals published by Mexican teacher-training colleges

Graciela Cordero Arroyo [CV] [gcordero@uabc.edu.mx

Norma Leticia Carrillo Chávez [CV] [carrillo.norma@uabc.edu.mx

Maricela López-Ornelas [CV] [ornelas@uabc.edu.mx

Ana Gabriela Zepeda Fuentes [CV] [ana.zepeda42@uabc.edu.mx

Abstract

Introduction: The results of the research projects carried out by the academic community have been and will continue to be recognised, valued, published and disseminated by scholarly journals, regardless of their format. The role Higher Education Institutions (HEI) as publishers of scholarly journals is fundamental. **Methods:** The purpose of this article is to analyse the basic editorial features of the scholarly journals published by Mexican teacher-training colleges. The study uses a descriptive quantitative approach to examine a sample of journals based on the editorial criteria established by Latindex, the Regional Online Information System for Scholarly Journals from Latin America, the Caribbean, Spain and Portugal. **Results and conclusions:** The study has revealed that no research has been carried out on this type of publications in México; that the number of publications published by

Mexican teacher-training colleges is small, and that the analysed publications do not meet basic editorial requirements. The results of this diagnosis can help Mexican teacher-training colleges to make the necessary decisions to increase the quality, visibility and chances of survival of their journals.

Keywords

Teacher-training colleges; normal schools; scholarly journals; editorial quality; visibility.

Contents

1. Introduction. 2. Teacher-training colleges as publishers of scholarly journals. 3. Methods. 4. Results. 4.1. Basic features. 4.2. Presentation features of journals. 4.3. Editorial management and policy features. 4.4. Content features. 4.5. General editorial features. 5. Conclusions. 6. Notes. 7. References.

Translation by **CA Martínez-Arcos**
(PhD in Communication, University of London)

1. Introduction

The knowledge generated by scientific research is key for “the production, economic development and social growth of all countries” (Burgos, 2010, quoted in Fregoso *et al.*, 2013, p. 446) and for this reason it is essential to create spaces to disseminate and promote it. In this regard, scholarly journals are the primary medium for the cumulative recording of knowledge (Ríos, 2000; De Oliveira, Degani-Carneiro, da Silva and Marafon, 2015), and a scientific communication channel that facilitates the dissemination of research advances (Ruiz, Galán, Diestro, 2014).

Research on scholarly journals has increased in parallel to their development in the 1980s (Delgado López-Cózar, 2015). These studies recognise the importance of their formal, technical, economic and evaluative aspects. Authors such as Diestro, Ruiz-Corbella and Galán (2017) point out that research on scholarly journals has transitioned from focusing on their scientific-formal quality to their levels of visibility.

As an object of study, scholarly journals have been profusely researched at the international level. Some of the most important authors in the last ten years are Abadal and Rius-Alcaraz (2008); Baiget (2014); Tur-Viñes *et al.* (2014); Delgado (2014); Baladrón-Pazos, Correyero-Ruiz, and Manchado-Pérez (2014); Álvarez-Nobell and Castillo-Esparcia (2015); Delgado López-Cózar (2015), De Pablos and Túñez-López, (2015); Fischman and Alperín, (2015); Spinak and Packer (2015); Giménez-Toledo (2016); Martínez-Nicolás and Saperas-Lapiedra (2016); San Miguel, Tur-Viñes and Fonseca-Mora (2016); Melero (2017) and Navas (2017). In this respect, it is important to mention that the most prolific analyses of the editorial features of scholarly journals have been mainly carried out by researches from Spanish higher education institutions.

The situation is different in Mexico, where only a few authors have studied the positioning, quality and visibility of printed and digital scholarly journals in a continuous way -and for more than a decade-. This group of researchers includes López-Ornelas (2010); Sánchez-Pereyra (2014); Alonso-Gamboa

and Reyna (2015), Cetto (2015); Aguado-López and Becerril-García (2016); and Rogel-Salazar (2017), among others.

Alonso-Gamboa and Reyna (2015) have particularly led the study of scholarly journals in the country. In their paper titled “Mexican scholarly journals. Panorama and prospective”, they point out that the production of scholarly journals in Mexico had different institutional origins. Based on the 2014 journal survey, Alonso-Gamboa and Reyna (2015) identified 2,542 publications, of which 53% (1,357) belonged to universities or higher education institutions. The National Autonomous University of Mexico (UNAM, for its initials in Spanish) was the institution that published the largest number of journals in the country. With respect to the remaining publications, 15% (391) were published by academic or professional societies; 12% (307) by private higher education institutions; 11% (280) by government institutions; 8% (187) by research institutions not associated with universities; and finally, 1% (20) by international organisations based in the country. These figures reveal the valuable contribution of higher education institutions to the production of scientific publications for more than two decades (Villalón and Aguillo, 1998) and, thus, to the dissemination of research-based knowledge (Cetto, Alonso-Gamboa, Packer and Aguado-López, 2015).

This article focuses on the study of the scholarly journals published by Mexican teacher-training colleges, also known as “normal schools” [1]. Although in Mexico these colleges or schools have been considered higher education institutions (HEI) since more than three decades ago and, therefore, have assumed the substantive functions of research and dissemination, their participation in the generation and dissemination of knowledge at the national level has not reached the expected results (*Subsecretaría de Educación Superior*, 2015; Ortega-Díaz and Hernández-Pérez, 2016).

The objective of this article is to analyse the basic editorial features of these journals to evaluate the efforts made by Mexican teacher-training colleges to disseminate the knowledge they generate and, thus, meet their social duties. This first diagnosis will allow us to evaluate the possibilities of Mexican teacher-training colleges to get their scientific publications indexed in national databases and repositories and increase their visibility and chances of survival.

2. Teacher-training colleges as publishers of scholarly journals

In 1984 a presidential decree established that Mexican teacher-training colleges had to grant bachelor’s degrees, had to be transformed into higher education institutions, and had to develop additional functions such as research and dissemination of knowledge (*Diario Oficial de la Federación* [DOF], 1984).

While the aim of this research is not to analyse the problems faced by teacher-training colleges to become higher education institutions, it is relevant to mention that, according authors such as Ortega-Díaz and Hernández-Pérez (2016), teacher-training colleges face complex situations to carry out research projects unlike other higher education institutions. Teacher-training colleges have made a very limited contribution to the field of educational research due to their focus on teaching (Rubio and Castro, 2017); which involves an excess of teaching hours and, in turn, reduces the time allocated to research and publication (Ortega-Díaz and Hernández-Pérez, 2016).

Our literature review did not reveal research works focused on the dissemination of scientific knowledge through scholarly journals. This subject has not been the object of study of education or communication researchers or authorities. There are no works on this subject in the 2002-2011 Literature Reviews published by the Mexican Council for Educational Research (López, Sañudo and Maggi, 2013). Information on the journals published by teacher-training colleges was neither provided in the analyses of these institutions carried out by Mexico's Undersecretary of Higher Education (SES, 2015) and Medrano, Ángeles y Morales (2017). Hence, the diagnosis presented here is considered the first in this line of research.

3. Methods

The study is exploratory and descriptive in its approach. The units of analysis are the journals published by Mexican teacher-training colleges. To carry out the study, we analysed the last three numbers of each journal, except for one (*Temachtiani*) that did not provide access to past numbers. In this case, we decided to analyse only the last number available. Research work was carried out from September to December 2017, and was divided in the following four phases:

Phase 1. Identification of the journals published by Mexican teacher-training colleges.

We carried out an extensive review of the websites of the teacher-training colleges that are recognised the most for their academic work in the country. The Google search engine and Google academic were used to carry out this review. In addition, we consulted federal and state-level educational authorities via emails, text messages and phone calls.

Phase 2. Selection of journals with International Standard Serial Number (ISSN).

This phase focused on the identification of journals that have their own ISSN. According to Gaëlle Béquet, the Director of the ISSN International Centre of Paris, France (2015), the ISSN is a “natural key” for serial resources. It is a renown, long lasting and widely used norm, implemented by independent, non-profit entities (national centres), and linked to an international agreement. Therefore, the ISSN is indispensable to legitimise publications. In Mexico, to obtain the ISSN, publishing entities need to meet several formal requirements before the National Institute of Copyright (INDAUTOR) and may need to wait up to one year.

Phase 3. Selection of criteria to classify journals with ISSN.

The criteria used to analyse the journals published by Mexican teacher training colleges are a selection of the editorial criteria established by the “Regional Online Information System for Scholarly Journals from Latin America, the Caribbean, Spain and Portugal” (hence Latindex), which was set up in 1997 by the National Autonomous University of Mexico (UNAM) [2].

Latindex determines and defines specific criteria to include scholarly journals in its catalogue: 36 criteria for online journals and 33 for printed journals. The three extra indicators considered for online journals respond to the peculiarities of the online environment. In both cases, the following four categories are considered regardless of the format of the journal under evaluation:

- 1) Basic features
- 2) Presentation features

- 3) Editorial management and policy features
- 4) Content features.

For the purposes of this research, we selected only 28 criteria and eliminated those that could not be identified in the journals. The selected criteria are shown in the following table [3].

Table 1 *Analysis criteria for journals with ISSN*

Criteria	Definition
Category: Basic features	
1. Identification of editorial board	The journal mentions the existence of an editorial council or committee or a scientific responsible body. The editorial board can be formed by the director general, editor, executive editor, editor in chief, among others.
2. Content	To fulfil this requirement, at least 40% of the documents included in the journal must be: original articles; review articles; technical reports; conference papers; short communications; letters to the editor; state of the art reviews or book reviews. In all cases, academic scientific content must predominate.
3. Authors	Works must be signed by their authors, including name and surname, or corporate authors.
4. Publisher	The name of the journal's publisher must be placed in a visible place.
5. URL	The URL of the journal must be mentioned in the main page of its website or in the browser.
6. Address	The postal or email address of the journal's management team must be shown in visible place for the purposes of requesting subscriptions, making exchanges, submitting manuscripts, and following-up actions, among others.
Category: Presentation features	
7. Presentation pages	These must include at least the journal's full title, ISSN, volume, number, date and bibliographic information.
8. Mention of periodicity	The journal must mention its periodicity or, in its absence, the number of instalments it will publish in the year.
9. Historical access to content	The journal must provide access to all previous issues or at least to the numbers published in the last three years.

Criteria	Definition
10. Article's bibliographic information	It must appear at the beginning of each article and must identify the source. It must contain at least: the journal's full or abbreviated title and numbering (volume, number, part, month or equivalent).
11. Editorial board members	The journal must disclose the names of the editorial board members.
12. Institutional affiliation of editorial board members	The journal must disclose the names of the institutions to which the editorial board members are affiliated. It is not enough to just mention the country.
13. Affiliation of authors	The journal must mention the entity to which the author is affiliated.
14. Reception and acceptance of manuscripts	To meet this requirement, the journal must mention both dates.
Categories: Editorial management and policy features	
15. ISSN	Online journals must have their own ISSN. This requirement is not met if only the ISSN of the printed version appears.
16. Aims and scope	The journal must mention its aims and scope or, in its absence, the target audience.
17. Review system	The journal must explain the procedure used to select the articles to be published.
18. External reviewers	The journal should mention whether the arbitration system uses external reviewers.
19. External authors	At least 50% of the published works must be written by external authors. In the case of journals published by associations, only the members of the association's editorial board or board of directors are considered internal authors.
20. Indexation in information services	To qualify, the journal must be indexed in any information service such as abstracts indexation service, directory, catalogue, online database or lists of core national journals, among others. The information service may be mentioned by the journal itself or added by the evaluator.
21. Compliance with periodicity	The journal must comply with the periodicity stated in criterion 10.

Criteria	Definition
Categories: Content features	
22. Instructions for authors	To meet this requirement, the instructions for authors must appear on the submission of manuscripts or contents section in at least one number of the year.
23. Reference list and citation style guide	The instructions for authors must include a reference list and citation style guide.
24. Originality requirement	The journal's presentation or instructions for authors must mention the requirement of originality for submitted works.
25. Abstract	All articles must be accompanied by an abstract in the original language of the work.
26. Abstract in two languages	Articles must include abstracts in the original language of the work and in a second language.
27. Keywords	Articles must include keywords or equivalent in the original language of the work.
28. Keywords in two languages	Articles must include keywords or equivalents in the original language of the work and in a second language.

Phase 4. Analysis of journals based on the selected criteria from Latindex.

Once the criteria were selected, we produced a checklist containing the four categories and their corresponding criteria: 1) Basic features (6 criteria), 2) Presentation features (8 criteria), 3) Editorial management and policy features (7 criteria), and 4) content features (7 criteria).

The checklist registered four types of response: “√” indicates compliance with the requirement; “X” indicates non-compliance with the requirement; “*” indicates lack of information on the part of the journal and “**” indicates partial compliance with the requirement.

4. Results

The search for journals in Google search engine and Google Scholar and the interviews with authorities from Mexican teacher-training colleges across states revealed a population of 32 publications.

Table 2 *Journals with ISSN published by Mexican teacher-training colleges*

Federal Entity	Publisher	Name of journal	Launch year	ISSN year
Chiapas	<i>Centro Regional de Formación Docente e Investigación Educativa del Estado de Chiapas</i> (“Regional Teaching Training and Educational Research Centre of the State of Chiapas”)	1. <i>Revista Interdisciplinaria de Estudios Latinoamericanos - RIEL</i> (“Interdisciplinary Journal of Latin American Studies”)	2017	2017
		2. <i>Revista Electrónica de Investigación e Innovación Educativa -REIIE</i> (“Electronic Journal of Educational Research and Innovation”)	2016	2016
Chihuahua	<i>Centro de Investigación y Docencia</i> (“Research and Teaching Centre”)	3. <i>Acoyauh</i>	1995	2015
Mexico City	<i>Escuela Normal Superior de México</i> (“Higher Normal School of Mexico”)	4. <i>Revista de la Escuela Normal Superior de México</i> (“Journal of the Normal School of Mexico”)	1957	1996
		<i>Escuela Normal No. 3 de Toluca</i> (“Normal School No. 3 of Toluca”)	5. <i>Temachtiani</i>	2003
State of Mexico	<i>Instituto Superior de Ciencias de la Educación del Estado de México</i> (“Higher Institute of Education Sciences of the State of Mexico”)	6. <i>Revista ISCEEM</i> (“Journal of the Higher Institute of Education Sciences of the State of Mexico”)	2006	2012
San Luis Potosí	<i>Benemérita y Centenaria Escuela Normal del Estado de San Luis Potosí</i> (“Meritorious and Centenarian Normal School of the State of San Luis Potosí”)	7. <i>Educando para Educar</i> (“Educating to Educate”)	2000	2011
Tabasco	<i>Coordinación de Escuelas Normales</i> (“Coordination of Normal Schools”), <i>Instituto de Educación Superior del Magisterio</i> (“Teachers’ Higher Education Institute”) and <i>Universidad Pedagógica Nacional</i> (“National Pedagogical University”) of the Undersecretary of Secondary and Higher Education	8. <i>Revista Transformación (Con)ciencia educativa Nuestras voces. Nuestras acciones</i> (“Journal of Transformation (with) educational science. Our voices. Our actions”)	2016	2016

However, this population was reduced significantly with the exclusion of 24 journals that did not have the ISSN. Table 2 presents the list of the final 8 selected journals, indicating the federal entity to which they belong, their publisher, launch year and year when the ISSN were obtained.

As we can see in Table 2, four journals are published by teacher-training colleges: 1) *Revista de la Escuela Normal Superior de México*, 2) *Temachtiani*, 3) *Revista ISCEEM* y 4) *Educando para Educar*. On the other hand, *Revista Transformación* is published by a state-level authority, the Coordination of Normal Schools, the Teachers' Higher Education Institute (IESMA, for its initials in Spanish) and the National Pedagogical University of the Undersecretary of Secondary and Higher Education of State of Tabasco. The three remaining journals are published by teacher-training colleges that are identified as research centres. Such is the case of: 1) *Revista Interdisciplinaria de Estudios Latinoamericanos (RIEL)*, 2) *Revista Electrónica de Investigación e Innovación Educativa (REIIE)*, both published by the Regional Teaching-Training and Educational Research Centre of the State of Chiapas; and 3) *Acoyauh*, published by the Research and Teaching Centre of Chihuahua.

As for the launch year, three journals were recently created: *RIEL* (in 2017), *Revista Transformación* (in 2016) and *REIIE* (in 2016). These three publications obtained their ISSN the same year their first number was published. Journals that were launched in previous years obtained their ISSN in the current decade. *Revista de la Escuela Normal Superior de México* stands out as the oldest journal in the group, with 60 years of life. It obtained its ISSN in 1996, 39 years after it published its first number.

Teacher-training colleges that publish journals with ISSN are located in the north, centre and south of the country. As table 2 shows, three journals are published in the centre of the country, Mexico City and the State of Mexico: *Revista de la Escuela Normal Superior de México*, *Temachtiani*, and *Revista ISCEEM*, respectively. *Revista Transformación* is published in Tabasco and *RIEL* and *REIIE* in the state of Chiapas. The states of Tabasco and Chiapas are located at the southeast of the country. *Educando para Educar* is published in the state of San Luis Potosí, located in the central-north region of the country. Meanwhile, *Acoyauh* is published in the northwest region of the country, in the state of Chihuahua.

4.1. Basic features

The basic features of any publication, as the name implies, are those that are considered inherent to scholarly journals. Most of the analysed journals meet the six criteria that make up this category: identification of editorial board, content, authors, publisher, URL and address.

In the case of criterion number 2, “Content”, only five journals fulfilled it with the publication of original articles. This is the case of: 1) *REIIE*, 2) *Acoyauh*, 3) *Revista ISCEEM*, 4) *Educando para Educar*, and 5) *Revista Transformación*. *Temachtiani* and *RIEL* do not mention that they only accept unpublished materials while *Revista de la Escuela Normal Superior de México* did not include this criterion. This criterion did not assess the scientific and academic content of the articles because the journals did not properly develop the instructions for authors, as it will be shown in criterion 22, which is described below.

In relation to criterion number 5, “mention of URL”, not all the analysed journals had an online version and some of them were retrieved from the ISSUU platform [1], were some teacher-training colleges publish their journals.

Table 3 *Printed and online journals: basic features*

Federal entity	Publisher	Journal's name	Mention of editorial board	Content	Identification of authors	Publisher	Mention of URL	Mention of address
Chiapas	Centro Regional de Formación Docente e Investigación Educativa del Estado de Chiapas	1. <i>Revista interdisciplinaria de Estudios Latinoamericanos (RIEL)</i>	✓	*	✓	✓	X	✓
		2. <i>Revista Electrónica de Investigación e Innovación Educativa (REIIE)</i>	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Chihuahua	Centro de Investigación y Docencia	3. <i>Acoyauh</i>	✓	✓	✓	✓	X	✓
Mexico City	Escuela Normal Superior de México	4. <i>Revista de la Escuela Normal Superior de México</i>	✓	X	✓	✓	X	✓
State of Mexico	Instituto Superior de Ciencias de la Educación del Estado de México	5. <i>Revista ISCEEM</i>	✓	✓	✓	✓	X	✓
	Escuela Normal Superior del Estado de México	6. <i>Temachtiani</i>	✓	*	✓	✓	X	✓
San Luis Potosí	Benemérita y Centenaria Escuela Normal del Estado de San Luis Potosí	7. <i>Educando para Educar</i>	✓	✓	✓	✓	X	✓
Tabasco	Coordinación de Escuelas Normales, Instituto de Educación Superior del Magisterio (IESMA) and UPN of the Undersecretariat of the High School Education	8. <i>Revista Transformación (Con)ciencia educativa Nuestras voces. Nuestras acciones</i>	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓

*Information not provided by the journal

All journals meet criterion number 1, “identification of editorial board”, number 3, “identification of authors”, number 4, “publisher”, and number 6, “mention of address” (see Table 3).

4.2. Presentation features of journals

All journals met criterion number 11, “Members of the editorial board”, since they all disclosed the names of the members of that board. However, five of the eight journals used a different name to refer to this body, which is very common in the general scope of scholarly journals. *Revista ISCEEM* and *Revista Transformación* refer to this board as “editorial committee”. The functions of these bodies are not clearly defined in the journals.

Table 4 *Printed and online journals: presentation features*

Federal entity	Name of journal	Presentation pages					Periodicity mention	Historical access to content	Article bibliographic info	Editorial board members	Institutional affiliation of editorial board members	Authors' affiliation	Reception and acceptance of manuscripts	
		Journal title	ISSN	Volume	Number	Date								Bibliographic info
Chiapas	1. <i>Revista interdisciplinaria de Estudios Latinoamericanos (RIEL)</i>	✓	✓	X	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	
	2. <i>Revista Electrónica de Investigación e Innovación Educativa (REIIE)</i>	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	
Chihuahua	3. <i>Acoyauh</i>	✓	✓	X	✓	✓	X	✓	✓	X	✓	✓	X	
Mexico City	4. <i>Revista de la Escuela Normal Superior de México</i>	✓	✓	X	✓	✓	✓	X	X	✓	✓	X	**	X
State of Mexico	5. <i>Revista ISCEEM</i>	✓	✓	X	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	X	✓	X	✓	✓
	6. <i>Temachtiani</i>	X	X	X	X	X	X	✓	X	X	✓	X	X	X
San Luis Potosí	7. <i>Educando para Educar</i>	✓	✓	X	✓	✓	X	✓	✓	X	✓	✓	✓	
Tabasco	8. <i>Revista Transformación (Con) ciencia educativa Nuestras voces. Nuestras acciones</i>	✓	✓	X	✓	✓	X	✓	✓	X	✓	✓	X	

Most of the journals met criterion 7, “presentation pages” (see Table 1), which corresponded to the full title of the journal, ISSN, volume, number, and bibliographic information. In the case of *Temachtiani*, the journal number was only available in its PDF format, and the file did not have a cover page, so compliance with the requirement was not possible to confirm.

Criterion number 8, “mention of periodicity”, was met in seven of the eight journals under studied, and not met by *Revista de la Escuela Normal Superior de México*. In relation to criterion number 9, “Historical access to content”, it was met by six publications. *Revista de la Escuela Normal Superior de México* and *Temachtiani* did not provide access to past issues. Regarding criterion 13, “affiliation of authors”, it was met by six journals, and partially by *Revista de la Escuela Normal Superior de México*, i.e., it was only met in some articles, while *Temachtiani* did not meet the criterion in any of its published articles (see Table 4).

In the case of criterion number 12, “institutional affiliation of editorial board members”, only four of the eight analysed journals referred to the names of the institutions to which the members of their editorial board were attached. The four journals that meet this criterion are: 1) *Educando para Educar*, 2) *Revista Transformación*, 3) *RIEL* and 4) *REIIE*.

Criterion 14, “reception and acceptance of manuscripts”, it was met by four journals which disclosed the dates of reception and acceptance of their articles. The journals assessed positively in this regard are: 1) *Educando para Educar*, 2) *RIEL*, 3) *REIIE* and 4) *Revista ISCEEM*. Table 4 shows the checklist used to examine the presentation features category.

Criterion 10, which requires the “bibliographic information” at the beginning of the article, was met with the lowest frequency in the presentation features category, since five of the eight analysed journals lacked this information. The three journals that fulfilled the criterion are: 1) *RIEL*, 2) *REIIE* and 3) *Revista de la Escuela Normal Superior de México*.

4.3. Editorial management and policy features

The results of the analysis of this criterion are detailed in Table 5. Given that the main criterion for the selection of the journals was that they had to prove they had obtained an ISSN, this criterion was fulfilled by the eight publications.

Criterion number 16, “aims and scope”, was fulfilled by six journals, and not met by *Revista de la Escuela Normal Superior de México* and *Revista ISCEEM*, which did not mention their aim, scope or target audience.

With regards to criterion number 19, presence of “external authors”, it was fulfilled by six journals: 1) *RIEL*, 2) *REIIE*, 3) *Acoyauh*, 4) *Revista ISCEEM*, 5) *Educando para Educar* and 6) *Revista Transformación*.

Five of the eight analysed journals met criterion number 17: explanation of “arbitration system”. Three journals did not fulfil this criterion because they did not refer to the procedure used for the selection

of articles. This was the case of: 1) *Temachtiani*, 2) *RIEL* and 3) *Revista de la Escuela Normal Superior de México*.

Criterion 21, “compliance with periodicity”, was only met by four of the eight analysed journals. Such is the case of: 1) *RIEL*, 2) *Revista ISCEEM*, 3) *Educando para Educar*, and 4) *Revista Transformación*.

Table 5 *Printed and online journals: editorial management and policy features*

Federal Entity	Name of journal	ISSN	Aims and scope	Review system	External reviewers	External authors	Indexation	Periodicity compliance
Chiapas	1. <i>Revista interdisciplinaria de Estudios Latinoamericanos (RIEL)</i>	✓	✓	X	X	✓	✓	✓
	2. <i>Revista Electrónica de Investigación e Innovación Educativa (REIIE)</i>	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	X
Chihuahua	3. <i>Acoyauh</i>	✓	✓	✓	*	✓	X	X
Mexico City	4. <i>Revista de la Escuela Normal Superior de México</i>	✓	X	X	X	X	X	X
State of Mexico	5. <i>Revista ISCEEM</i>	✓	X	✓	*	✓	✓	✓
	6. <i>Temachtiani</i>	✓	✓	X	X	*	X	X
San Luis Potosí	7. <i>Educando para Educar</i>	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	X	✓
Tabasco	8. <i>Revista Transformación (Con) ciencia educativa Nuestras voces. Nuestras acciones</i>	✓	✓	✓	X	✓	X	✓

* No information available in journal

The criteria met with lower frequency in this section were number 18, “external reviewers”, and number 20, “indexation in information services”, as shown in Table 5. Regarding the first criterion, which refers to the need to have a review system that includes external reviewers to the publisher, it was fulfilled by two of the eight analysed journals: 1) *REIIE* and 2) *Educando para Educar*. Meanwhile, criterion 20, “indexation in information services”, was only met by three of the eight analysed journals, which were included in indexes, directories, databases, etc. *RIEL* is part of the catalogue of the Latin American Council of Social Sciences (CLACSO, for its initials in Spanish); *REIIE* is indexed in the database of Latin American Citations in the Social Sciences and Humanities (CLASE, for its initials in Spanish), in the directory and online journals section of Latindex, in

Actualidad Iberoamericana and CLACSO; and *Revista ISCEEM* is incorporated in Latindex the Index of Higher Education and Educational Research Journals (IRESIE, for its initials in Spanish) and the Catalogue of Mexican Journals of Education (CATMEX, for its initials in Spanish).

4.4. Content features

In terms of content features, none of the eight journals fulfilled all the criteria, as shown in Table 6.

In the case of criterion 25, “abstract”, it was met by six of the eight analysed journals. *Revista Transformación* did not fulfil this criterion, while *Revista de la Escuela Normal Superior de México* only fulfilled it partially, as only some of its articles had an abstract.

Table 6 *Printed and online journals: Content features*

Federal Entity	Name of journal	Instructions for authors	Citations and references guide	Originality requirement	Abstract	Abstract in two languages	Keywords	Keywords in two languages
Chiapas	1. <i>Revista interdisciplinaria de Estudios Latinoamericanos (RIEL)</i>	X	X	X	✓	✓	✓	✓
	2. <i>Revista Electrónica de Investigación e Innovación Educativa (REIIE)</i>	X	X	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Chihuahua	3. <i>Acoyauh</i>	✓	X	✓	✓	X	✓	X
Mexico City	4. <i>Revista de la Escuela Normal Superior de México</i>	X	X	X	**	X	X	X
State of Mexico	5. <i>Revista ISCEEM</i>	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
	6. <i>Temachtiani</i>	X	X	X	✓	X	✓	X
San Luis Potosí	7. <i>Educando para Educar</i>	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Tabasco	8. <i>Revista Transformación (Con) ciencia educativa Nuestras voces. Nuestras acciones</i>	X	✓	✓	X	X	X	X

* Not completely fulfilled

A similar result was obtained with Criterion 27, “keywords”, because only six of the eight analysed journals fulfilled it. It was observed that the same journals that fulfilled the abstract criterion also met the requirement of keywords. The six journals they met the criterion are: 1) *RIEL*, 2) *REIIE*, 3) *Acoyauh*, 4) *Revista ISCEEM*, 5) *Temachtiani*, and 6) *Educando para Educar*.

Criterion number 24, “requirement of originality”, was fulfilled by five journals. In the case of the three remaining journals, the requirement of originality was not mentioned in their presentation pages or rules for collaborations. The five journals that met this criterion are: 1) *REIIE*, 2) *Acoyauh*, 3) *Revista ISCEEM*, 4) *Educando para Educar*, and 5) *Revista Transformación*.

Four of the eight analysed journals met criterion 26, “abstract in two languages” and criterion 28, “keywords in two languages”. The four journals that met these criteria are: 1) *RIEL*, 2) *REIIE*, 3) *Revista ISCEEM*, and 4) *Educando para Educar*.

The criteria that were met with the lowest frequency were number 22, “instructions for authors” and number 23, “Citations and reference list style guide”, since only three of the eight analysed journals met these criteria, as shown in Table 6.

Two journals met criteria 22 and 23: *Revista ISCEEM* and *Educando para Educar*. *Acoyauh* provided instructions for authors but not a reference list and citation style guide. *Revista Transformación* does not provide instructions for authors but does provide a guide for citations and references.

The five journals that did not meet criterion 23, did not publish instructions for authors and therefore neither published their reference list and citation style guide. This was the case of: 1) *Temachtiani*, 2) *RIEL*, 3) *REIIE*, 4) *Acoyauh*, and 5) *Revista de la Escuela Normal Superior de México* (see Table 6).

4.5. General editorial features

In relation to the general fulfilment of the selected analytical criteria, two of the eight analysed journals stood out for meeting the highest number of criteria: 1) *Educando para Educar*, published by the Meritorious and Centenarian Normal School of the State of San Luis Potosí, and 2) *REIIE*, published by the Regional Teaching Training and Educational Research Centre of the State of Chiapas. Both journals fulfilled 26 criteria.

Table 7 *Latindex editorial criteria fulfilled by journals*

Name of journal	Criteria				Total
	Fulfilled	Partially fulfilled	Not fulfilled	Lack of information	
1. <i>Educando para Educar</i>	25	0	3	0	28
2. <i>Revista Electrónica de Investigación e Innovación Educativa (REIIE)</i>	25	0	3	0	28
3. <i>Revista ISCEEM</i>	23	0	4	1	28
4. <i>Revista interdisciplinaria de Estudios Latinoamericanos (RIEL)</i>	21	0	6	1	28
5. <i>Revista Transformación (Con) ciencia educativa Nuestras voces. Nuestras acciones</i>	19	0	9	0	28

6. <i>Acoyauh</i>	18	0	9	1	28
7. <i>Temachtiani</i>	10	0	16	2	28
8. <i>Revista de la Escuela Normal Superior de México</i>	8	2	18	0	28

In contrast, *Revista de la Escuela Normal Superior de Mexico*, published by the same institution on the journal's name, and *Temachtiani*, published by the Normal School No. 3 of Toluca, met the smallest number of requirements, as shown in Table 7.

5. Conclusions

The collected evidence shows that teacher-training colleges are not very experienced in the publishing of scholarly journals. This could be because teacher-training colleges have not been consolidated as higher education institutions and because they are focused on teaching, despite having other two substantive functions (research and cultural dissemination). It can be argued that teacher-training colleges are still focused in the training of teachers, to the detriment of the development of the research and dissemination (SES, 2015).

Of the 32 journals published by these institutions, only eight obtained and incorporated the ISSN. The eight publications analysed here meet the requirements of Latindex to different degrees. Some of them have ISSN but lack basic editorial features. In fact, in some cases, it was difficult to locate the three numbers of each journal to form to body of analysis as there was no access to their historical archive, or the numbers were not complete on their websites, which affected the fulfilment of the selected criteria in the present study.

Only three of the eight journals met the basic requirements for scholarly publications: *Educando para Educar*, published by the Meritorious and Centenarian Normal School of the State of San Luis Potosí, *Revista ISCEEM*, published by the Higher Institute of Education Sciences of the State of Mexico, and *REIIE*, published by the Regional Teaching Training and Educational Research Centre of the State of Chiapas.

Of them, two are included in Latindex: 1) *REIIE* and 2) *Revista ISCEEM*. According to this study, *REIIE* fulfilled 25 criteria and *Revista ISCEEM* fulfilled 23. *Educando para Educar* was one of the two publications (together with *REIIE*) that fulfilled the highest number of criteria (25), however, the analysis of the third category (editorial management and policy features) showed that the journal was not indexed in any database or directory service. This information indicates that the journal has the basic features that are required from scholarly journals to be indexed in scientific databases, which is an opportunity that should be considered by the journal's editors. For example, to be indexed by Latindex, journals must meet the eight mandatory requirements and at least 17 of the other criteria, and achieve a minimum of 25 fulfilled criteria (Latindex, no date/b).

Also striking is the fact that two of the journals, *Temachtiani* and *Revista de la Escuela Normal Superior de México*, meet only one third of the criteria, which is a situation that prevents them from advancing in their consolidation.

On the other hand, there is no research on journals published by Mexican teacher-training colleges and, in general, there is “ignorance about our own journals, which contrasts with the constant editorial activity in our region, especially in the academic field, and as a result, if we know little about these journals, we will use them little too” (Cetto, 2015, p. 12).

In this sense, it is important to carry out this type of works because they show the potential of the publications of Mexican teacher-training colleges. At the same time, we expect these results will encourage the editors of the publications with similar problems, to recognise the importance of fulfilling the necessary criteria that will allow them to be listed in indexing systems, such as Latindex, the Network of Scientific Journals from Latin America, Caribbean, Spain and Portugal (Redalyc), and the Scientific Electronic Library Online (SciELO). These and many other initiatives have joined the open access (OA) movement and have developed it according to the realities of Latin America (Cetto, Alonso-Gamboa, Packer and Aguado-López, 2015).

The open access movement has generated a wide range of alternatives in the field of scientific communication, where the initiatives of these organisms (Latindex, Redalyc and SciELO, among many others), offer free workshops to update and train publishers to understand the importance of “adopting standards and good practices to support the making of better journals” (Cetto, Alonso-Gamboa, Packer and Aguado-López, 2015, p. 25), which is an alternative that can be recommended to the editors of these journals.

Clearly, the number of teacher-training colleges that are committed to disseminate knowledge through their own journals is small. In that sense, it would be necessary for the teacher-training colleges or the federal government to allocate resources to drive this kind of effort, as well as to guide publishers on the importance of fully fulfilling the criteria established by Latindex. These first steps would raise the visibility of these journals and would increase their chances of survival.

6. Notes

[1]. According to the study carried out by Mexico’s National Institute for Educational Assessment and Evaluation (INEE, for its initials in Spanish) about *Normal education in Mexico*, there is a diversity of institutions specialised in the initial training of elementary education teachers, including: normal schools, higher normal schools, experimental normal schools, normal education centres, rural normal schools, urban normal schools, teacher updating centres, national teacher schools, institutes, physical education schools, art schools, school centres, and others (colleges, schools, universities) (Medrano, Ángeles and Morales, 2017). Therefore, for the purposes of this study, the term “teacher-training colleges” will be used to refer to any educational institution responsible for the formation of basic education teachers (DOF, 2018, p. 2).

[2]. The origin of Latindex dates back to the works commissioned in the First Workshop on Scientific Publications in Latin America, held in 1994 in the city of Guadalajara, and followed up in the National Autonomous University of Mexico (UNAM) in 1997. Initially, it was conceived as a Latin American index, but it extended its reach to Spain and Portugal in 1998 when institutions from these two countries requested to join the system (Alonso-Gamboa and Reyna, 2012, p. 2).

[3]. Table 1 shows the 28 selected criteria and their definition. In some cases, adjustments were made in the drafting of the descriptors presented by Latindex.

[4]. “Issuu is an online service that, in a context characterised by the rise of the so-called e-books, allows the networked publishing and sharing of documents like portfolios, books, journals and reports, with an attractive and dynamic visualisation format, and offers users the possibility to locate, share and comment them, from the authors’ personal profiles or from groups” (Joomla, para. 1, no date). Available at <http://creatic.innova.unia.es/edicionpublicacion/presentcatebooks/issuu-detail>

7. References

E Abadal, & L Rius-Alcaraz (2008): “Revistas científicas de las universidades españolas: acciones básicas para aumentar su difusión e impacto”. *Revista española de documentación científica*, 31(2), pp. 240-260. Recuperado de <http://redc.revistas.csic.es/index.php/redc/article/view/427>

E Aguado-López & A Becerril-García (2016): “¿Publicar o perecer? El caso de las Ciencias Sociales y las Humanidades en Latinoamérica”. *Revista Española de Documentación Científica*, 39(4), pp. 1-14. Recuperado de <http://redc.revistas.csic.es/index.php/redc/article/view/955>

JO Alonso-Gamboa & R Reyna (2015): “Revistas académicas mexicanas. Panorama y prospectiva”. *Ciencia Ergo Sum*, 3(22), pp. 181-191. Recuperado de <http://www.redalyc.org/articulo.oa?id=10441539002>

JO Alonso-Gamboa & R Reyna (2012): “La revista académica iberoamericana en Latindex. Una visión de 15 años”. *Biblioteca universitaria*, 15(2), pp. 123-138. Recuperado de <http://www.redalyc.org/html/285/28528265002/>

A Álvarez-Nobell & A Castillo-Esparcia (2015): “Autores en revistas latinoamericana de mayor impacto de comunicación”. *Opción*, 31(3), pp. 70-90 Recuperado de <http://www.redalyc.org/html/310/31045567005/>

T Baiget (2014): “Las revistas científicas ante la digitalización y la globalización”. *Revista Española de Drogodependencias*, 39(1), 5-11. Recuperado de <http://eprints.rclis.org/31544/>

G Béquet (2015): “Tendencias Clave del ISSN en 2015”. En Jornada Académica XXI Reunión Latindex. Madrid, España. Septiembre-Octubre. Recuperado de http://www.latindex.org/lat/documentos/Espana_2015/BequetISSN2015.pdf

AM Cetto (2015): “Las revistas científicas en América Latina y el Acceso Abierto” (AA). *Espacio I+ D*, 4(7). Recuperado de http://espacioimasd.unach.mx/articulos/num7/pdf/acceso_abierto.pdf

AM Cetto, JO Alonso-Gamboa, L Packer & E Aguado-López (2015): “Enfoque regional a la comunicación científica. Sistemas de revistas en acceso abierto”. En JP Alperin & G Fishman (Edit.),

Hecho en Latinoamérica: acceso abierto, revistas académicas e innovaciones regionales. Pp. 19-41. Ciudad Autónoma de Buenos Aires: CLACSO. Recuperado de <http://repositorio.ciem.ucr.ac.cr/handle/123456789/196>.

AJ Baladrón-Pazos, B Correyero-Ruiz, & B Manchado-Pérez (2014): “Tres décadas de investigación sobre comunicación en España. Análisis de las revistas científicas de comunicación (1980-2013)”. *Communication y Society* 27(4), pp. 49-71. <https://dadun.unav.edu/handle/10171/37913>

JE Delgado (2014): “Scientific Journals of Universities of Chile, Colombia, and Venezuela: Actors and Roles”. *Education Policy Analysis Archives*, 22 (34), pp. 1-26. Recuperado de <http://dx.doi.org/10.14507/epaa.v22n34.2014>

E Delgado López-Cózar (2015): “Las revistas electrónicas en acceso abierto: pasado, presente y futuro”. *RELIEVE. Revista Electrónica de Investigación y Evaluación Educativa*, 21(1), pp 1-15. Recuperado de https://www.uv.es/RELIEVE/v21n1/RELIEVEv21n1_M1.pdf

K De Oliveira, F Degani-Carneiro, N da Silva, & J Marafon (2015): “Sistemas de evaluación de las revistas científicas en Latinoamérica”. En JP Alperin & G Fishman (Edit.), *Hecho en Latinoamérica: acceso abierto, revistas académicas e innovaciones regionales*. Pp. 63-76. Ciudad Autónoma de Buenos Aires: CLACSO. Recuperado de <http://repositorio.ciem.ucr.ac.cr/handle/123456789/196>

Diario Oficial de la Federación [DOF]. (1984): *Acuerdo que establece que la Educación Normal en su Nivel inicial y en cualquiera de sus tipos y especialidades tendrá el Grado Académico de Licenciatura*. Recuperado de http://www.dof.gob.mx/nota_detalle.php?codigo=4660109&fecha=23/03/1984

Diario Oficial de la Federación [DOF]. (2016): *Acuerdo número 21/12/16 por el que se emiten las Reglas de Operación del Programa para el Desarrollo Profesional Docente para el Ejercicio Fiscal 2017*. Recuperado de http://www.dgesu.ses.sep.gob.mx/documentos/DSA%20gobmx/PRODEP/Reglas_2017.pdf

JM De Pablos & M Túnuez-López (2015): “Qué es y cómo afecta el “Índice H” en Comunicación. Uso ético de los perfiles en GSM”. En *Desafíos éticos de la comunicación en la era digital: III Congreso Internacional de Ética de la Comunicación*, libro de actas. Facultad de Comunicación de la Universidad de Sevilla, días 24, 25 y 26 de marzo de 2015. LA Guadarrama Rico, JC Suárez Villegas & MM González Jiménez (eds.). Pp. 163-174. Sevilla: Universidad de Sevilla. Recuperado de <https://idus.us.es/xmlui/handle/11441/38878>

A Diestro, M Ruiz-Corbella & A Galán (2017): “Calidad editorial y científica en las revistas de educación. Tendencias y oportunidades en el contexto 2.0”. *Revista de Investigación Educativa*, 35(1), pp. 235-250. Recuperado de <http://revistas.um.es/rie/article/view/244761>

G Fischman & JP Alperín (2015): “Revistas científicas hechas en Latinoamérica. En JP Alperin & G Fishman (Edit.), *Hecho en Latinoamérica: acceso abierto, revistas académicas e innovaciones regionales*. Pp. 107-116. Ciudad Autónoma de Buenos Aires: CLACSO. Recuperado de <http://repositorio.ciem.ucr.ac.cr/handle/123456789/196>

M Fregoso, R Flores, D Moreno, D González, L Ibarra, Y López, L Sañudo, L. & D Sevilla (2013): “Distribución y uso del conocimiento educativo producido en México en la década 2002-2011”. En M López, L Sañudo & R Maggi (Coords.) *Investigación sobre la investigación educativa 2002-2011. Colección Estados del Conocimiento*. Pp. 445-512. México: COMIE.

E Giménez-Toledo (2016): “Publicaciones científicas “periféricas”.” *Revista d'arqueologia de Ponent*, 2016. núm. 26, pp. 289-293.
<http://www.raco.cat/index.php/RAP/article/download/317792/407806>

Instituto Nacional del Derecho de Autor [INDAUTOR]. (s.f.): *¿Qué es el ISSN?* Recuperado de http://www.indautor.gob.mx/issn/que_es_issn.html

Latindex. (s.f./a): *Qué es Latindex*. Recuperado de <http://www.latindex.org/latindex/descripcion>

Latindex. (s.f./b): *Características editoriales para revistas electrónicas*. Recuperado de <http://www.latindex.org/latindex/editElectronicas>

Latindex. (s.f./c): *Características editoriales para revistas impresas*. Recuperado de <http://www.latindex.org/latindex/editImpresas>

M López, L Sañudo & R Maggi (2013): “*Investigación sobre la investigación educativa 2002-2011*”. Colección Estados del Conocimiento. México: COMIE

M López-Ornelas (2010): “Estudio cuantitativo de los procesos de comunicación de Revista Latina de Comunicación Social (RLCS), 1998-2009”. *Revista Latina de Comunicación Social*, 65, pp. 538-552 Recuperado de http://www.revistalatinacs.org/10/art3/917_Mexico/39_Maricela.html

M Martínez-Nicolás & E Saperas-Lapiedra (2016): “Objetos de estudio y orientación metodológica de la reciente investigación sobre comunicación en España (2008-2014)”. *Revista Latina de Comunicación Social*, 71, pp. 1365-1384. Recuperado de <http://www.revistalatinacs.org/071/paper/1150/RLCS-paper1150.pdf>

V Medrano, E Ángeles & MA Morales (2017). “*La educación normal en México. Elementos para su análisis*”. México: INEE.

R Melero (2017): “El perfil de las revistas españolas respecto al acceso abierto, derechos de explotación y reutilización de sus contenidos”. En Abadal, E. (ed.). *Revistas científica. Situación*

actual y retos futuros. Pp. 181-195. España, Universitat de Barcelona. Recuperado de <http://digital.csic.es/bitstream/10261/162951/1/Libro-revistas.pdf>

M Navas (2017): La situación de las revistas a nivel internacional. *In Revistas científicas: situación actual y retos de futuro*, pp. 35-52. Edicions de la Universitat de Barcelona. Recuperado de <http://eprints.rclis.org/32130/>

C Ortega-Díaz & A Hernández-Pérez (2016): La conformación del cuerpo académico en la escuela normal, un medio para mejora en la formación docente. *Ra Ximhai*, 12(6), pp. 295-303. Recuperado de <http://www.redalyc.org/html/461/46148194020/>

J Villalón & I Aguillo (1998): “Revistas electrónicas en ciencias sociales y humanidades”. *Revista española de documentación científica*, 21(3), pp. 303-316. Recuperado de <http://redc.revistas.csic.es/index.php/redc/article/view/358/605>

J Ríos (2000): “Normalización de revistas científicas mexicanas: campo de investigación y aportación”. *Biblioteca Universitaria*, 3(2), pp. 85-91.

M Rubio & G Castro (2017): “La investigación educativa: un estudio exploratorio a las tesis de primera generación del plan 2012 de la licenciatura en educación primaria” Ponencia presentada en XIV Congreso Nacional de Investigación Educativa, San Luis Potosí, México: COMIE.

R Rogel-Salazar (2017): “La importancia de la edición científica y los fugaces bordes de sus límites”. *Espacio I+D Innovación más Desarrollo*, vol. VI, 14, pp. 8-20. Recuperado de http://www.espacioimasd.unach.mx/articulos/num14/La_importancia_edicion_cientifica_fugaces_bordes_limites.php

M Ruiz, A Galán & A Diestro (2014): “Las revistas científicas de Educación en España: evolución y perspectivas de futuro”. *RELIEVE*, 20(20). Pp, 1-27. Recuperado de https://www.uv.es/RELIEVE/v20n2/RELIEVEv20n2_M1.pdf

V Tur-Viñes, C López-Sánchez, JA García del Castillo Rodríguez, M López-Ornelas, J Monserrat-Gauchi & MC Quiles Soler (2014): “Especialización y revistas académicas españolas de Comunicación”. *Revista Latina de Comunicación Social*, 69, pp. 12-40 Recuperado de http://www.revistalatinacs.org/069/paper/999_Alicante/02_Tur.html

BG San Miguel, V Tur-Viñes y MC Fonseca-Mora (2016): “Principios éticos de los editores en las revistas científicas españolas de Comunicación, Educación y Psicología”. *Ibersid: revista de sistemas de información y documentación*, 10(2), pp. 53-60. Recuperado de <https://ibersid.eu/ojs/index.php/ibersid/article/view/4310>

A Sánchez-Pereyra (2014): “Visibilidad mundial y bibliométrica para las revistas científicas mexicanas a través de la colección SciELO-México”. Tema del mes. Recuperado de <http://www.ru.tic.unam.mx:8080/handle/123456789/2261>

Subsecretaría de Educación Superior [SES]. (2015). Diagnóstico de las escuelas normales. México: Autor E Spinak & AL Packer (2015): “350 años de publicación científica: desde el “Journal des Sçavans” y el “Philosophical Transactions” hasta SciELO” *SciELO en Perspectiva*, 5. Recuperado de <http://blog.scielo.org/es/2015/03/05/350-anos-de-publicacion-cientifica-desde-el-journal-des-scavans-y-el-philosophical-transactions-hasta-scielo/>

How to cite this article in bibliographies / References

G Cordero Arroyo, NL Carrillo Chávez, M López-Ornelas, AG Zepeda Fuentes (2019): “Editorial features of scholarly journals published by Mexican teacher-training colleges”. *Revista Latina de Comunicación Social*, 74, pp. 325 to 346.

<http://www.revistalatinacs.org/074paper/1333/16en.html>

DOI: [10.4185/RLCS-2019-1333en](https://doi.org/10.4185/RLCS-2019-1333en)

Article received on 5 November 2018. Accepted on 10 January.
Published on 27 January 2019.